Social Determinants of Cousin Marriages (A Case Study of District Rawalpindi, Pakistan)

Bilgees Fatima and Inam Ullah Leghari

Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, Pakistan

The present study explores the socio-cultural causes of cousin marriages. The main objective of the study is to investigate and explain the social determinants of high prevalence of cousin marriages in the rural and urban context of Rawalpindi District of Punjab, Pakistan. An overall sample of 40 respondents was selected through purposive sampling from the areas of Dhok Paharrian and Gulshan Abad in Rawalpindi. Qualitative techniques such as interviews, focus group discussions were employed to gather data around the topic. The significant results reveal that traditions, inheritance, dowry, family pressures, cooperation, security, geographic proximity, caste, sect, love for family and sympathy, mutual support for family members are the major social determinants of cousin marriages. Consanguineous marriage is a dominant mode of marriage pattern despite the awareness of genetic risks. People think that diseases are linked with destiny and luck. There is a need for deliberate education, awareness and legislation that can help and play their role to decrease the rate of consanguineous marriages.

Keywords: cousin marriages, consanguineous marriages, social determinants, Pakistan, Rawalpindi, causes of cousin marriages

Approximately 1.1 billion people around the world have consanguineous marriages, and among them one in every three marriages is between cousins (Hamamy, Antonarakis, Cavalli-Sforza, Temtamy, Romeo, Ten-Kate &Bathija, 2011). Cousin marriages are a socially, customarily, or ritually perceived union which is recognized by society. Marriage is defined as a legitimate contract between life partners that develops rights and responsibilities between them (Masocha, 2014). Cousins are relatives with whom a person shares one or more common progenitors (ancestors). Children of paternal uncles and paternal aunts i.e. children of father's brothers and sisters are first cousins. Children of maternal uncles (mother's brothers) and maternal aunts (mother's sisters) are also considered first cousins. Cousins have common grandparent and consanguineous marriages are between cousins or between individuals who share another generally late progenitor (Bennett, 2011).

Corrospendance regarding this article should be addressed to Dr.Inam Ullah Leghari, Assistant Professor, Department of Anthropology, Quaid-i-Azam University, University Road, Islamabad. Postal Code 45320.e mail: leghari2001@gmail.com
Contribution of Authors:

_

^{1:} Bilqees Fatima conceived the idea and executed the research including the first write- up of the paper

^{2:} Dr.Inam Ullah Leghari supervised during whole process of the research and article writing, critically revised the manuscript and contributed to the discussion and literature review. Both authors contributed in the final manuscript.

In some cultures, consanguineous marriages are considered as an ideal type of marriages while in others they are greatly discouraged. These marriages are observed worldwide although they have now also come to be widely regarded by the media and in public health discourse as posing genetic risks. Awareness of the disadvantages of this practice is also found among the masses, as health impacts emerge among the children of people who are practicing cousin marriages. However, these impacts are unable to reduce the rate of consanguineous marriages. Social reasons to marry to a cousin are considered more important than the effect on children's health. Traditions overcome the fear of negative impacts of consanguineous marriages (Shaw, 2009).

Ottenheimer (1996) argues that marriage prohibitions were introduced to maintain the social order, uphold religious morality, and safeguard the creation of healthy offspring (Ottenheimer, 1996). It is estimated that 10% of all marriages in the world are consanguineous marriages (Jamie, 2014). In Pakistan, almost 70% marriages are consanguineous marriages (Pellissier, 2012). In terms of legality of cousin marriages, they are legally banned and prohibited in countries like Zimbabwe and Greece. In some other countries it is legal to marry a cousin, but this practice is considered as having incestuous connotations and people have developed a feeling of fear toward cousin marriages. Marriages between cousins are thought favorable in many parts of Asian, African, and Middle Eastern countries (Grady, 2002).

Consanguineous marriage is widely described in anthropological literature as the 'preferred' type of marriage in many populations. Cousin marriage is legalized in Pakistan. It has gained currency owing to social, cultural, and monetary reasons. In a traditional society, mates are selected mostly by parents or family and owing to established norms numerous cousins cheerfully go for marriage (Shaw, 2009). Generally, the order of the marriage preference followed in Pakistani Punjab is cousin, own *biradiri* (kinship group), distant relative and then another suitable *biradiri* (kinship group) (Donnan,1988; Lyon& Mughal, 2016). Children of consanguineous marriages may have an increased risk of genetic disorders. In Pakistan, blood disorders are increasing in the general population, which, according to Hamamy, is due to the higher level of the consanguineous marriages. Cousin marriages are being practiced for centuries in many parts of the world. The risk of malformation is higher in related people than unrelated people. This is almost 2.5 times more than out of family marriages (Hamamy, 2012). Higher level of inbreeding was reported in Pakistan among those persons who are suffering from disorders. Recessive genes are the main and common factor in enhancing these diseases (Shami, Qaisar, & Bittles, 1991). Generally, first cousins and close relatives are the most preferred choices for marriages in Pakistani Punjab (Farooq, Kayani, & Ahmad, 2015).

There is an increase in the global discussion of genetic risks. People are aware of these risks, but they stick to cultural norms and traditional patterns of behaviour owing to large prevalence of cousin marriages. The socio-cultural determinants found in this study will help to understand the causes behind these marriages. In Pakistan, the endogamous marriages are practiced to a great extent, with cousin marriages being practiced in every urban and rural area of Pakistan (Lukacs, 2013).

This paper explores reasons for endogamy in selected research locale which leads to cousin marriages. One of the main causes is traditional marriage patterns, as people do not want to deviate from their traditional marriage patterns. It is a common perception that cousin marriages will be stable, secure and will not lead to divorce. People prefer consanguineous marriages within the close relatives due to a perceived comfort with blood relatives rather than someone who comes from

different caste or tribe. Spouses are coming from similar backgrounds; they and their families know each other since early childhood. Cousin marriages are perceived to enhance family unity. Blood relations are considered to have love, sympathy, and emotional attachment for their family members more than others. Dowry and inheritance play a vital role in cousin marriages. Family does not rely on material things. If dowries are inescapable, a cousin marriage emerges as another choice.

Current study will significantly help to fill the research gaps in previous studies by providing social and cultural dimension of the phenomenon from Anthropological perspective.

Setting the Scene

This study was conducted in two locations, Dhok Paharian and Bahria Town in Rawalpindi, a city adjacent to the capital of the country. Bahria Town is a new private housing society, where people from different socio-economic backgrounds live. Dhok Paharian is a rural area but it is changing greatly and has developed significantly. Mostly, joint family system is common in this locality. A rural and an urban area were selected to get a better picture of the phenomenon.

Method

Qualitative techniques such as interviews, Participant observation and focus group discussions were employed to gather data around the topic. Participant observation was made possible by living in the field and participating in different daily activities. 40 respondents were selected through purposive sampling. Out of 40 respondents, 20 were selected from Dhok Paharian and 20 were selected from Bahria Town. To ensure equal gender participation 10 females and 10 males were selected from each locale. Target population were those respondents who were cousins and bound in the relationship of marriage. Interviews were open ended and flexible. Two focus group discussions were conducted in each locale. Each focus group discussion had 15 participants and it comprised of sixty minutes. Participants were stimulated to discuss the topic with the help of moderator. FGDs helped to cross verify the data collected through interviews. The interviews were conducted in Punjabi and Urdu then transcribed into English. Local language words have been written in italic with their translation. Data has been interpreted and analysed thematically according to different themes that emerged from data.

Results

The main cause of cousin marriage is that it is a traditional marriage practice, members of the society subscribe to this practice owing to normative pressures. This practice is more common in rural areas than urban areas, where consanguineous marriages are found but to a lesser extent (Mir, Kaufman, Noor, Motazacker, Jamil, Azam & Naeem, 2009). The main reason to favour consanguineous marriages is the similar family traditions (Mughal, 2018). Marriage patterns can be understood within the cultural context of a society. Respondents perceive some benefits in cousin marriages, as their ancestors practiced it and their predecessors are continuously repeating and maintaining this practice. They are of the view that they are culturally bound to follow these traditions and if they go beyond these traditional practices, they would be reprimanded and punished by their family members in the form of family boycott. One respondent said, "We have roots of cousin marriages in the past; thus, we cannot deviate from these traditions. "It was found during the study that respondents were already aware of the scientific researches on consanguineous marriages, drawbacks of cousin marriages in the form of biomedical effects on the children. However, they said that they could tell about several cases where no disability had been seen in the children of consanguineously married couples and therefore felt no need to deviate from their traditional

marriage patterns. A respondent shared his opinion that marriages are settled in the heaven in following words:

It is all about fate. Marriages are settled in the heaven. Humans are helpless. Match is written in fate, already made in heaven, humans only give name to those predestined matches.

One of the reasons found was that respondents tried to enhance union between their children, so their families may remain intact with one another. According to Rytter marriage is mainly used to reinforce the relations between families (Rytter, 2012). Most of the respondents had married their cousins according to the will of their parents. In some cases, the married cousins were known to each other from early childhood and hence they had no issue in marrying their cousin. In addition, because of these marriages, family members were thought to come closer to one another. "In any difficult time, they are expected to help each other", a respondent stated, citing a reason of how consanguineous marriages helps the family. "The bond between families becomes stronger and unity increases, marriage within a family makes marriage stronger because of blood relations and ties", was a common theme emerging in the discussions. Cousin marriage was thought to "transmit cultural values to the next generation". Blood relations make these marriages stronger. Some respondents had different viewpoint though; they were of the view that cousin marriages are increasing because it is a common misperception that it increases family unity while decreasing family unity. Relatives do not tolerate little things in the family so the relationship between two families changes. Each side of the family starts expecting more from the other family and failing to meet these expectations on both sides leads to family disputes and quarrels. One of the justifications of these marriages provided by the respondents was that couples from the same family know each other well and hence they find no difficulties in adjustment because their mental level is compatible with each other. They do not need much time to understand each other because they already know each other and have socialized together from their early childhood. They have had helping and friendly behaviour with each other. They fight less because they have mutual understanding. Families also perceive that husband and wife will easily adjust due to the relationship already established between both families. Their mother tongue is also same. They share common traditions, customs, and status. Their cultural and moral values and environment is the same. Therefore, they feel comfortable in making their brother's or sister's children as their daughter or son in law. Compatibility is composed of moral values and attitudes. Incompatibility does not only affect the couple themselves, but it also affects the whole family. Family members are thought to be compatible. "They can discuss any matter with each other regarding children." Cousin marriages that are "compatible" are considered safe. Many families interviewed thought, "If the spouses are compatible then they have no problem or conflict." Compatibility depends on the behaviour of people and their ability to satisfy reciprocally each other's interpersonal needs. There is mutual understanding between couples. Social, physical, mental, emotional, and communicational compatibility is needed for the maintenance of a good relationship. One perceived reason expressed in favour of these marriages is the love that is present between brothers and sisters. They bind their children to marry each other so their unity enhances, and family bonds become more intact. They think that their relations become stronger because of these family ties. A 45 years respondent used the proverbial words "saanjhy dukh sukh" (shared sorrows and happiness) as follow:

People share happiness and sorrow when they get married in family. They help and support each other in the time of grief and trouble. Happiness increases and sadness decreases when all the family

members are together. If marriage is done out of family than there are very rare chances of sharing grief and sorrow.

Respondents stated that their parents had a lot of emotional attachment between the siblings and they got their children married to their cousins as a result. Sometimes, family pressure makes the boy or girl agree to marry with their cousin even if they do not like to live together. They might want to or consider breaking this marriage bond, but through the perceived pressure of the family, they decide to compromise and keep living together. They fear "a break of family alliances". With the passage of time, they start adjusting in that environment and then they start living happily. Among families where endogamy is the preferred mode of marriage, it is considered slightly insulting to the rest of the family if a desirable, beautiful girl or financially stable boy marries outside the family, if there are matching mates within the family. Family members are annoyed on these decisions taken by their children and the implication inferred by the family members is that he or she (or their parents) considered all the other candidates undeserving for their astonishing child. Therefore, a consanguineous marriage is sometimes observed to avoid raising any dispute among the family members, along with other reasons. Family members are mutually bounded. They help in every matter of life, so parents feel it better to marry their children in the family. When a girl is married within a family, her in-laws already know her, and they want and try to make their home comfortable for that girl. The same goes with the boy; his in-laws cooperate with him in every matter and at every step of life. Thus, cousin marriages make and utilise a close network of relatives through family alliances.

An important determinant of consanguineous marriage is that it is easy for parents to search a compatible match for their children within their own family. Searching for a spouse out of own family is considered a difficult and cumbersome job. Grooms and brides are easily available within the family and parents find it easy to arrange a cousin marriage rather than search for a spouse for their children from out of their families. Investigation about the status of candidates is easy within the family. In case of out of family marriage, it is difficult to find mutual social connections or links for investigation of the future spouse. There is also a risk that the information provided by unknown people is wrong. Some respondents perceived that there is nothing hidden or obscured about the marriage partner if they find a match from their own family. They know the exact situation of health and finance of each other. They perceive that family ties are encouraged by these marriages, while also encouraging family solidarity. Some parents fear that if their boy marries to a girl from out of their family, she will leave them unattended at their old age. Husbands are typically seen as taking the wife away from her family to join his family in Pakistan. Groom, who is from family, is more likely to support the bride, keeping close contact with her parents and supporting them in their old age. Another factor is that children are unable to deny the decision of their parents. Mostly they are financially dependent on their parents so they cannot go against the decisions of their parents. In consanguineous marriages, parents as well as elders try to influence their children, whether the children are conducive to the idea or not. Moreover, there are social values and norms which prevent them from going against the elders' decision. These social norms are set from early childhood. Some families have cousin marriages from generation to generation. Children see these kinds of marriages from early childhood and it is rooted in their sub consciousness that the same practice will be repeated with them. Many cousin marriages occurred because parents said that they had made promise in early childhood of their children or had engaged their children with their cousins. The concept of "Zuban" (promise) is prevailing strongly in local research context. Sometime such kinds of marriages are in opposition to children's will. "Zuban de di" (as we have now promised) so they (children) must marry there. "Samjhoota" (compromise) disturbs the couple's mentally. The

marriages which are based on "Zuban" mostly result in the form of divorce because the boy and girl were not willing to marry each other which lead to clashes and disputes. One of the main determinants of these marriages is that people marry in their own family (khandan), biradiri (kinship group), zat (caste), qaum (caste) etc. (Alavi 1972; Das 1973; Eglar, 1960). It is perceived that marrying within family, caste and kinship group will make their caste pure. Respondents said that by marrying out-of-family there will be an impurity in their caste. For example, some families believe that common blood leads to purity. They purify their family through cousin marriages. Association with their own group is common. In this way, their caste is perceived to be pure and their family prospers. If they get their daughter married out of family, there is perceived emergence of an issue of sect and sub sect, therefore, they prefer to marry their children within family. One of the respondents told that if old conflicts are present, parents use consanguineous marriages as a way of conflict resolution. Once they are bound through the relation of marriage, things start adjusting. Mostly, this decision is made by grandparents, so their children unite again.

Geographic proximity is another factor that is enhancing these marriages. As both families live near to each other geographically, the parents think that when their children get to marry cousins they will live near their home in the same neighbourhood. In villages, it is a common perception that they should not get their children married to a groom who belongs to another village. Parents in villages mostly wish to get their children marry within their family so that their children live in the same village. If a girl comes from a village the settlement is easy for her with her husband who also resides in a village. A girl from an urban area who has an urban lifestyle before marriage feels difficulties in surviving in village after marriage as the new person faces difficulty in the adoption of an environment new to her. Family members already know the environment and lifestyle of their relatives, so it is more comfortable that their children are married to someone from within the family. The parents of bride mostly want to have a groom from same city so that their daughter stays close to them. It is easy for groom to visit his in-laws when they are from the same city or village and the bride can also see her parents with ease. In families residing jointly, bride and groom often live within the same household. The parents consider it to be a better marriage where husband and wife share the same house as the parents. Interviews done with some individuals living in joint families revealed that they were of the view that joint family system becomes stronger due to consanguineous marriages. One of the respondents said that her parents and her uncle lived in different cities far from each other and they were thinking of getting their children married to each other; in this way they could come nearer to each other. Consanguineous marriage is a common cultural practice which is mostly associated with the stability of marriages, as both spouses come from similar backgrounds and have similar expectations of what a marriage is supposed to be. One of respondents reported having some marital difficulties and quarrels with his wife. Family members helped to reconcile the issue and put familial pressure on both partners to sustain their relationship. Their grandparents were equally related to both spouses and they were fair for both partners. They had an equal amount of authority over both spouses and their parents. They acted as the judge or mediator to resolve the matter. Their issue was resolved soon and now they have a good married life. It is perceived that the divorce rate is very low in cousin marriages. People think that if they are giving their daughter within their own family, she must be secure there. Her in-laws cannot do anything wrong, or they cannot send their daughter back home. It is a protective factor against divorce. A 30 years old respondent described his perspective in following way:

One should marry in family preferably among cousin. One's family members are with you in any difficult situation. If your closed one beats you, he or she will throw you in shadow, there is no trust of others (*Ghair*). If you marry outside the family, it will be insecure. Blood is always thicker than water.

Same is the case with a groom. If both partners are cousins and they understand each other it is mostly perceived that they will never end up with a divorce. In case of any dispute, the two families can easily settle it amicably, thus reducing the likelihood of divorce. If there is any quarrel, dispute or difference in opinion, family members can settle them easily which reduces the chance of divorce. Family conflicts, if any, are resolved sooner which helps decreasing the risk of divorce rate. There is usually pressure from both sides on the couple to try and live together, whatever the situation is. A bride coming from out-of-family settles into her in-laws later than the bride who comes from within the family. A bride from own family knows the family from her childhood which makes it is easy for her to survive. This is one of the main reasons people prefer these marriages.

In cousin marriages, both persons are from the same family and the marriage takes place easily without having any pre-requisites. Both partners are from the same class so there is no hurdle in making a relation. Marriage arrangements are made easier to handle, and property is retained in the family. On the other hand, parents establish a marriage relationship out-of-family only when the groom has a good job and is well settled. Bride and groom are mostly from the same class and it is not difficult for them to survive. If a girl is from an upper class she should be married in the upper class. If she marries in the middle or lower class, it will be very difficult for her to survive; the chance of breakup increases whether it is consanguineous marriage or out-of-family marriage. Dowry and wealth have high significance in marriages in Pakistani context. Some respondents said that marriages are not dependent upon dowry, inheritance, etc. It depends on trust, respect, relations, ethics, behaviour, and customs. After marriage, the groom is expected to pay all expenses of his bride. Bride's parents give dowry at the time of marriage based on a big amount. If dowries are inescapable, a cousin marriage emerges as another choice. In endogamous marriages, the bride's family relies on the trust on kinship obligations instead of dowry and inheritance. In these marriages, value of dowry is lower than in out-of-family marriages. Family does not consider material things. In out-of-family marriages people need a huge amount of wealth in the form of dowry. This is a major cause to push people for cousin marriages. Families know each other very well, so they do not expect a lot from each other in terms of wealth rather they help each other at these occasions. Marital networks are used as an important strategy for financial interests (Lyon & Mughal, 2016). The rate of consanguineous marriages is higher in traditional society like in Punjab due to the reason that land is inherited through the male line (Afzal, Ali, Siyal, & Hakim, 1994). In these societies, daughters move in with their husband's family. Landowners mostly do endogamous marriages so that their land remains within their family. A 50 years old respondent linked cousin marriages with the inheritance and tradition:

If unfortunately, appropriate match is not found in family than the girl will spend her life in parents' home with no complaint. In this way, inheritance will remain in the family and will not be transferred or distributed among other families.

The practice of consanguineous marriages would keep the land and property within the family. A person who is closely related (first cousin) will keep the inherited family wealth within the family. Prosperous landowners have a desire to keep their property and wealth within their family.

They want to preserve their property within the same group. A villager said that in cousin marriages, people have higher rate of inheritance than others.

Summary and Conclusion

The main social determinant of the high prevalence of endogamous marriage patterns in Pakistan is traditional marriage patterns and normative pressures. Endogamy is thought to enhance social cohesion within the family group, strengthening social ties between relatives through the marriage of their children. Furthermore, consanguineous marriages are widely perceived to be safeguards against conflict, alienation and the highly stigmatised concept of divorce that is prevalent in Pakistani society.

Family members help one another in times of need and difficulty; have harmony and synchronization in their thinking. Blood relations have love, sympathy, and emotional attachment. Parents perceive that daughter-in-law from the family will stay with them even when they are old whereas a girl from out of family may leave them in their old age, so they prefer to marry their children within the family. People marry in their own families as they think their cast will remain pure. People think that common blood leads to purity.

Economic factors such as dowry and inheritance also play a vital role in influencing the practice of cousin marriages. Family does not rely on material things in these marriages. If dowries are inescapable, a cousin marriage emerges as the best available choice. The practice of consanguineous marriages also keeps the family land and property within the family. It also discourages land fragmentation. There is a famous quote among the people that "better the devil you know than the devil you do not know".

We would conclude the significance of counselling recommendations and legislation for cousin marriages and of undertaking both socio- cultural and genomic studies in defining its different effects and outcomes.

References

- Afzal, M., Ali, S. M., Siyal, H. B., & Hakim, A. (1994). Consanguineous Marriages in Pakistan. *The Pakistan Development Review*, *33*(4), 663-676.
- Alavi, H. A. (1972). Kinship in west Punjab villages. Contributions to Indian Sociology, 6(1), 1-27.
- Bennett, R. L. (2011). *The practical guide to the genetic family history*. New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons. Das. V. (1973). The structure of marriage preferences: an account from Pakistani fiction. *Man.* 8(1).
- Das, V. (1973). The structure of marriage preferences: an account from Pakistani fiction. *Man*, 8(1), 30-45.
- Donnan, H. (1988). Marriage among Muslims: Preference and Choice in Northern Pakistan.

 Delhi:Hindustan Publishing Corporation.
- Eglar, Z. S. (1960). A Punjabi village in Pakistan. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Farooq, A., Kayani, A. K., & Ahmad, K. (2015). Marriage and family structures in the rural Punjab: A shift from conservative to contemporary patterns. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 35(5), 306-324.
- Grady, D. (2002). Few risks seen to the children of 1st cousins. The New York Times, 1(1).
- Hamamy, H. (2012). Consanguineous marriages. Journal of community genetics, 3(3), 185-192.
- Hamamy, H., Antonarakis, S., Cavalli-Sforza, L. Temtamy, Romeo, Ten-Kate &Bathija, (2011). Consanguineous marriages, pearls and perils: Geneva International Consanguinity Workshop Report. *Genet Med* 13, 841–847. https://doi.org/10.1097/GIM.0b013e318217477f

Jamie, M.(2014). The Surprising truth about cousin marriage. Retrieved 02 12, 2016, from Today I Found Out: http://www.todayifoundout.com/index.php/2014/02/people-stop-thinking-appropriate-cousins marry/

- Lukacs, J. (Ed.). (2013). The people of South Asia: the biological anthropology of India, Pakistan, and Nepal. New York: Springer.
- Lyon, S.M., & Mughal, M.A.Z. (2016). Ties That Bind: Marital Networks and Politics in Punjab, Pakistan. Structure and Dynamics: eJournal of Anthropological and Related Sciences, 9(2): 110–122.
- Masocha, W. (2014). My Son Marries my Daughter says God. Bloomington: Trafford.
- Mir, A., Kaufman, L., Noor, A., Motazacker, M. M., Jamil, T., Azam, M., ... & Naeem, F. (2009). Identification of mutations in TRAPPC9, which encodes the NIK-and IKK-β-binding protein, in nonsyndromic autosomal-recessive mental retardation. *The American Journal of Human Genetics*, 85(6), 909-915.
- Mughal, M. A. (2018). Exchange Relations and Social Change in Rural Pakistan: Rituals and Ceremonies of Childbirth, Marriage and Death. *South Asia Research*, *38*(2), 177-194.
- Ottenheimer, M. (1996). Forbidden relatives: The American myth of cousin marriage. University of Illinois Press.
- Pellissier, H. (2012, 05 26). Cousin Marriage 70% in Pakistan Should it be Prohibited? Retrieved 03 15, 2016, from Institute for Ethics & Emerging Technologies: http://ieet.org/index.php/leET/more/pellissier20120526
- Rytter, M. (2012). Between Preferences: Marriage and Mobility among Danish Pakistani Youth. Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute, 18(3), 572–90.
- Shami, S. A., Qaisar, R., &Bittles, A. H. (1991). Consanguinity and adult morbidity in Pakistan. *The Lancet*, 338(8772), 954-955.
- Shaw, A. (2009). Negotiating risk: British Pakistani experiences of genetics. New York: Berghahn Books.

Received: June 5, 2019

Revisions Received: March 3, 2020